# Michael J. O'Connor, Esq. 332 Abbeyville Rd. Lancaster, PA 17603 (717) 571-8995

Wike, ocomor @ccomcagings

March 31, 2021

Russell Lucas, Esq.
Andrews & Price
1500 Ardmore Blvd., Suite 506
Pittsburgh, PA 15221

Shawnee S. Wood PSEA 3033 New Butler Road New Castle, PA 16101

rigeas@anvirawsandprice.com

sword (Secretors

Sharon City School District and Sharon Teachers Association PSEA/NEA Case No.: 88-21-2-W

Dear Mr. Lucas and Ms. Wood,

Enclosed is the fact-finding report in the above captioned case. Parties have ten (10) calendar days from the date of the issuance of this report to inform the Pennsylvania Labor Relations Board (PLRB) and each other if they accept or reject this report. In addition to overnight mail, this fact-finding report is also being e-mailed to you this date.

Confidentiality of the report should be maintained during the ten day consideration period and until officially released for publication by the Board in the event of a rejection.

Acceptance of the report must constitute approval of the report in its entirety and on an unqualified basis. The options are simply "accept," or, "reject."

Positions of the parties may be communicated to the PLRB by telephone on the last day of the consideration period and confirmed by a letter.

If there are any questions, please contact Nathan Bortner, Secretary of the PLRB at 717-787-1091

Sincerely,

Mulifolium Michael J. O'Connor, Esq.

Fact-Finder

cc Nathan Bortner, PLRB Secretary Stephen Getz, mediator

## COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA PENNSYLVANIA LABOR RELATIONS BOARD

#### IN THE MATTER OF THE FACTFINDING BETWEEN

SHARON CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT :

: FACT FINDING REPORT

And : CASE NO. ACT 88-18-5-W

:

SHARON TEACHERS ASSOCIATION :

PSEA/NEA :

### **FACT FINDING REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

**HEARING:** MARCH 17, 2021

**SHARON PA** 

FACT FINDER: Michael J. O'Connor, Esq.

FOR THE DISTRICT FOR THE ASSOCIATION

Russell Lucas, Esq. Shawnee Wood

### **Procedural History**

Pursuant to Act 88 of 1992 (Act 88) and the Public Employe Relations Act, Act 195 of 1970 (PERA), notice was received by the Pennsylvania Labor Relations Board (PLRB) from the Bureau of Mediation that no agreement had been reached between Sharon City School District (District) and the Sharon Teachers Association, PSEA/NEA (Association). By letter dated February 19, 2021, the PLRB appointed the undersigned to act as a factfinder, vested with the authority above. Subsequent to such notice, the parties were duly notified, and a hearing was held on March 17, 2021, in Sharon, Pennsylvania; at which time both parties were afforded a full opportunity to present testimony, examine and cross examine witnesses, and introduce documentary evidence in support of their respective positions.

This Report contains recommendations for the unresolved issues between the parties that created the impasse. The recommendations constitute the settlement proposal upon which the parties are now required to act, as directed by statute and PLRB regulations. Pursuant to statutory authority, this Report will be released to the public if not accepted. A vote to accept the Report does not constitute agreement with or endorsement of the rationales, but rather represents only an agreement to resolve the issues by adopting the recommendations. The parties are directed to review the Report and, within ten days of its issuance, notify the PLRB of their decision to accept or reject the recommendations.

### **Background**

The parties last collective bargaining agreement (CBA) ran from July 1, 2016 to June 30, 2020. The parties have agreed that the upcoming CBA should be for a four (4) year term.

The Sharon City School District is one of the fifteen (15) school districts located in Mercer County, PA. The District encompasses about five (5) square miles and is a small, urban, public school district serving the city of Sharon. It is comprised of three (3) elementary schools, one (1) middle school and one (1) high school. The District has about two thousand (2,000) students. It employs

approximately eleven (11) administrators, one hundred forty-five (145) teachers, and forty-two (42) full and part time personnel.

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS**

#### **TERM:**

I recommend a four (4) year term as follows:

# ARTICLE II TERM OF AGREEMENT

The term of this agreement shall begin July 1, 2020 and shall continue in force and effect through June 30, 2014.

The remainder of this provision in the current CBA shall stay the same.

#### PREPARATION TIME:

The District proposes an exception to the 30 consecutive minutes daily duty free preparation time during the student day for elementary specialized teachers (Art, Music, Technology, Library, Physical Education) to occur either before the student day begins or after the student day ends. The District wants to improve the efficiency of the school operation. The Association opposes any exception.

The Association proposes an addition to the preparation time section to limit the class sizes to the number of operating workstations, including, but not limited to classes for Art, Science Laboratories, Family and Consumer Sciences and other specialized classes. The Association wants to try and ensure all students have an equal opportunity to be engaged with all class activities. I believe the District's position is that this is something it would strive for but is within its managerial prerogative.

Although both proposals are understandable, they are not agreeable to the other party and I do not see an overriding interest to recommend a change to the current CBA. Therefore, I recommend the following:

# ARTICLE VI HOURS AND OTHER CONDITIONS OF EMPLOYMENT

#### Section 3 – Preparation Time

No change.

### **LEAVES OF ABSENCE/SICK LEAVE:**

The District proposes adding language that would require an employee to return to work for not less than thirty (30) days if they use sick leave to cover an absence of more than ten (10) days. The District's rationale is to avert employees from using extended periods of sick leave immediately prior to retirement. There is a provision in the current CBA in which employees retiring get paid for their unused sick leave; \$25/\$50 per day. The District has stated it cost over \$100,000, excluding costs of substitutes, when employees "burn" days prior to retirement. The Association does not agree with this proposal.

The District also proposes adding language that it reserves the right to require an employee to obtain a second opinion by a District approved doctor, after the ninth day of absence. The current CBA requires the Employee furnish a return to work letter from the doctor medically clearing the Employee. The Association opposes this proposal.

I do not recommend any change to the Leave of Absence/Sick leave section of the CBA. The current CBA addresses the requirements when an employee is absent for five (5) consecutive days; ie. a doctor excuse, which appears sufficient to address this situation. I understand the concern of the District, however, it may have an impact that is broader than proposed and unfairly harm those employees that are not "burning" days prior to retirement.

# ARTICLE VIII LEAVES OF ABSENCE

Section 1 – Sick Leave

No change

#### **INSURANCE AND OTHER BENEFITS:**

The District is proposing a Qualified High Deductible Health Plan (QHDHP) with an employee Health Savings Account (HSA) funded 35% of the applicable deductible by the District for 21-22, then similar percentages the remaining two (2) years of the proposed CBA. The initial year (2020-2021) would be the current PPO plan. The Association opposes this proposal stating that it would significantly increase the employees' monthly payments towards health insurance and there has not been sufficient time to adequately explain all aspects of such a plan. I do not recommend changing to a QHDHP with an employee HSA partially funded by the District. It appears that no other District in the County has a QHDHP. The other Districts have similar PPO plans. Also, the level of funding proposed by the District is below that of other nearby Districts that are outside the County.

The District also proposed changing the payout for unused sick days to retirees. The current contract has the payout of \$25 for the first 125 days, then \$50 for the unused sick days from 126-225. The District proposes \$25 for all days. The Association proposes sick days 1-225 be compensated at the current substitute rate of \$100. Based upon a review of the other districts in the County, I would recommend the language remain unchanged as the current rate(s) are similar to the majority of the other districts.

Since I do not recommend any change to a QHDHP plan, I likewise do not recommend any change to the retiree health insurance under the CBA.

The Association stated that it has been, and continues to be willing to discuss and make changes to the current PPO plan. I was provided documentation of comparisons of health care plans and contribution requirements of other Districts within the County but do not have any proposals from the parties with regard to changes to the deductibles or co-pays under the PPO plan and therefore do not make any recommendations other than to remain under the PPO and not switch to a QHDHP.

# ARTICLE IX INSURANCE AND OTHER BENEFITS

<u>Section 1 – Comprehensive Health Care Benefits.</u>

No change

<u>Section 4 – Retirement Allowance</u>

No change

#### **SALARY**

The District has proposed a freeze with no step movement in 20/21, \$800 plus step movement in 21/22, \$1000 plus step movement in 22/23 and \$1100 plus step movement in 23/24.

The District provided documentation pointing out its various costs which rank at or near the top of districts in the County; including costs for special education and cyber/charter students. It also stated that the median household income is near the bottom in the County, yet it has raised taxes in the past, to help pay the increased costs.

The District also noted how all Districts have been financially impacted by the COVID pandemic the last year and it is uncertain how much funding local districts will receive from the government.

The Association has proposed \$800 in 20/21, \$1000 in 21/22, \$1100 in 22/23 and \$1000 in 23/24. It also proposes step movement each year plus condensing the salary schedule from 14 steps to 12.

The Association rationale is its members currently trail the average salary in Mercer County by \$3300. Only three (3) districts currently make less then its members at the career rate level. Also, by cutting steps, the starting salary would increase, and teachers could reach their career rate sooner.

During the hearing there was much discussion and presentations of both sides of this issue and how much money is available in District funds to pay salaries and other operating costs. Many of the District concerns are based upon future uncertainties, which is valid since projections need to made, however there is available funds to support an increase in salaries staring with the current 2020-2021 school year; although not as significant as the Association proposed. The District did utilize prior year performance in making its projections, but the Association pointed out that the prior years data was unique and/or a one time issue that would potentially make sufficient money available for salary increases.

I recommend step movement in each year of the proposed contract. I recommend an increase of \$500 in year 20/21, \$800 in year 21/22, \$1000 in year 22/23 and \$1100 in year 23/24. The salary schedules are attached to this report.

I do not recommend condensing the salary schedule below 14 steps. Only one other District in the County has less than 14; and most have more than 14.

### **Athletic Director**

The District proposed that the Athletic Director, currently covered by the CBA, revert back to an administrative position with the ability to supervise and evaluate coaches once the current holder of the position no longer remains a full time professional employee. The Association stated it agreed to this so long as the District agrees to compensate athletic coaches for overnight trips. I do not recommend these contingent proposals become part of the CBA since it is my belief that the issue of the proper designation of the athletic director as a bargaining unit member or not is based on his current duties. That issue can properly be addressed at a later time.

### **Athletic Coaches**

The District proposed a new head coach that takes over a position after a resignation, retirement or non-renewal has the authority to hire his assistant coaches. The Association does not oppose this proposal.

The District also proposed that it has the authority to eliminate any extracurricular activity that falls below a threshold number of participants. The

Association has reservations with this proposal however I recommend this change since it is on a year to year basis and the extracurricular activity can be reinstated once the participants increase to the threshold level.

# ARTICLE X SALARY AND COMPENSATION

Salary schedules are attached.

### Section 4 – Athletic Contracts

#### D. Initial Contracts

- 1. [add to first paragraph] The parties agree that when an extracurricular activity head coach resigns or is not continued in the position, the assistant coach positions are opened as well.
- 2. Extracurricular activities that are not active or which fall below the threshold number of participants established by the District, may be eliminated in the District's sole discretion on a year to year basis. The District shall make the thresholds available to the Association at the beginning of each school year. In the event an activity is not held for a particular year, no extra duty pay will be paid.

The parties have reached four (4) tentative agreements:

ARTICLE IV – ASSOCIATION RIGHTS: Section 2 – Fair share language moved to Appendix with memorandum of Understanding

ARTICLE V- EMPLOYEE RIGHTS: Section 7 – Payroll Deductions to remove Fair Share Fees, U.S. Savings Bonds and Sharon Lifelong Learning Council.

ARTICLE VIII- LEAVES OF ABSENCE: Section 1 – Sick Leave; A. Well Days – adding 4 hour time limit for appointments.

ARTICLE X- SALARY AND COMPENSATION: Section 3 — Hourly rates for Additional Duties. C. Compensation for guidance counselors and psychologists' summer hours.

With respect to any other provision of the contract not discussed herein, I recommend that such provisions continue with their current language, unless revisions have been agreed to by both sides during the course of negotiations.

/s/
Michael J. O'Connor, Esq.
Fact Finder

March 31, 2021

<b>1</b> 4	ω	12	jul jul	10	9	CO	7	Q	CT	4	ω	N	<b> -</b> -	Step		
64,386	63,386	62,386	61,386	60,386	59,386	58,386	57,386	56,386	55,386	54,386	53,386	52,386	51,386	A		Bachelors B + 18
66,719	65,562	64,405	63,248	62,091	60,934	59,777	58,620	57,463	56,306	55,166	54,026	52,886	51,886	ᅜ		B+18
69,053	67,896	66,739	65,582	64,425	63,267	62,110	60,953	59,796	58,639	57,499	56,359	55,219	54,219	0		B + 24
71,386	70,229	69,072	67,915	66,758	65,601	64,444	63,287	62,130	60,973	59,833	58,693	57,553	56,553	ם		Masters
72,336	71,179	70,022	68,865	67,708	66,551	65,394	64,237	63,080	61,923	60,783	59,643	58,503	57,503	(H)	2020-202	M + 8
73,286	72,129	70,972	69,815	68,658	67,501	66,344	65,187	64,030	62,873	61,733	60,593	59,453	58,453	' <b>x</b> j	1 STA Sala	M + 16
74,236	73,079	71,922	70,765	69,608	68,451	67,294	66,137	64,980	63,823	62,683	61,543	60,403	59,403	ଦ	2020-2021 STA Salary Schedule	M + 24
75,186	74,029	72,872	71,715	70,558	69,401	68,244	67,087	65,930	64,773	63,633	62,493	61,353	60,353	Ш	le	M + 32
76,136	74,979	73,822	72,665	71,508	70,351	69,194	68,037	66,879	65,722	64,582	63,442	62,302	61,302	11-4		M + 40
77,086	75,929	74,772	73,615	72,458	71,301	70,144	68,986	67,829	66,672	65,532	64,392	63,252	62,252	احر		M + 48
78,036	76,879	75,722	74,565	73,408	72,251	71,093	69,936	68,779	67,622	66,482	65,342	64,202	63,202	×		M + 56
78,986	77,829	76,672	75,515	74,358	73,200	72,043	70,886	69,729	68,572	67,432	66,292	65,152	64,152	Ţ		M + 64

	, i	Step	H	Ø	ఆ	4	CT	O	7	ÇĐ.	ø	10	<del>   </del>	12	မ	프 4.
Bachelors		A	52,186	53,186	54,186	55,186	56,186	57,186	58,186	59,186	60,186	61,186	62,186	63,186	64,186	65,186
B + 18		B	52,686	53,686	54,826	55,966	57,106	58,263	59,420	60,577	61,734	62,891	64,048	65,205	66,362	67,519
B + 24	A B C D E F G H I J K	lO	55,019	56,019	57,159	58,299	59,439	60,596	61,753	62,910	64,067	65,225	66,382	67,539	68,696	69,853
Masters		Ы	57,353	58,353	59,493	60,633	61,773	62,930	64,087	65,244	66,401	67,558	68,715	69,872	71,029	72,186
M + 8	2021-202	Ħ	58,303	59,303	60,443	61,583	62,723	63,880	65,037	66,194	67,351	68,508	69,665	70,822	71,979	73,136
M + 16	2 STA Sale	[FI	59,253	60,253	61,393	62,533	63,673	64,830	65,987	67,144	68,301	69,458	70,615	71,772	72,929	74,086
M + 24	лу Schedu	ရ	60,203	61,203	62,343	63,483	64,623	65,780	66,937	68,094	69,251	70,408	71,565	72,722	73,879	75,036
M + 32	le	H	61,153	62,153	63,293	64,433	65,573	66,730	67,887	69,044	70,201	71,358	72,515	73,672	74,829	75,986
M + 40	M+8 M+16 M+24 M+32 M+40 M+48 M+56 M  2021-2022 STA Salary Schedule  E F G H I J K	62,102	63,102	64,242	65,382	66,522	67,679	68,837	69,994	71,151	72,308	73,465	74,622	75,779	76,936	
M + 48		63,052	64,052	65,192	66,332	67,472	68,629	69,786	70,944	72,101	73,258	74,415	75,572	76,729	77,886	
M + 56		×	64,002	65,002	66,142	67,282	68,422	69,579	70,736	71,893	73,051	74,208	75,365	76,522	77,679	78,836
M + 64		F	64,952	65,952	67,092	68,232	69,372	70,529	71,686	72,843	74,000	75,158	76,315	77,472	78,629	79,786

	Step	- Frank	22	ω	4	C/J	0	7	600	ဖ	10	H	12	13	4
		53,186	54,186	55,186	56,186	57,186	58,186	59,186	60,186	61,186	62,186	63,186	64,186	65,186	66,186
	Œ	53,686	54,686	55,826	56,966	58,106	59,263	60,420	61,577	62,734	63,891	65,048	66,205	67,362	68,519
	C	56,019	57,019	58,159	59,299	60,439	61,596	62,753	63,910	65,067	66,225	67,382	68,539	69,696	
	ש	58,353	59,353	60,493	61,633	62,773	63,930	65,087	66,244	67,401	68,558	69,715	70,872	72,029	73,186
2022-202	Ħ	59,303	60,303	61,443	62,583	63,723	64,880	66,037	67,194	68,351	69,508	70,665	71,822	72,979	74,136
2022-2023 STA Salary Schedule	<b>'</b> 2]	60,253	61,253	62,393	63,533	64,673	65,830	66,987	68,144	69,301	70,458	71,615	72,772	73,929	75,086
ry Schedu	<b>G</b>	61,203	62,203	63,343	64,483	65,623	66,780	67,937	69,094	70,251	71,408	72,565	73,722	74,879	76,036
le	H	62,153	63,153	64,293	65,433	66,573	67,730	68,887	70,044	71,201	72,358	73,515	74,672	75,829	76,986
	1	63,102	64,102	65,242	66,382	67,522	68,679	69,837	70,994	72,151	73,308	74,465	75,622	76,779	77,936
	IC.	64,052	65,052	66,192	67,332	68,472	69,629	70,786	71,944	73,101	74,258	75,415	76,572	77,729	78,886
133	×	65,002	66,002	67,142	68,282	69,422	70,579	71,736	72,893	74,051	75,208	76,365	77,522	78,679	79,836
	T	65,952	66,952	68,092	69,232	70,372	71,529	72,686	73,843	75,000	76,158	77,315	78,472	79,629	80,786

	Step	<b>j—</b> 1	Ŋ	မ	4	5	Ø.	7	00	ဖ	10	  -4 	12	13	4
Bachelors	<b> </b>	54,286	55,286	56,286	57,286	58,286	59,286	60,286	61,286	62,286	63,286	64,286	65,286	66,286	67,286
B+18	( <b>t</b> tt	54,786	55,786	56,926	58,066	59,206	60,363	61,520	62,677	63,834	64,991	66,148	67,305	68,462	69,619
B + 24	က	57,119	58,119	59,259	60,399	61,539	62,696	63,853	65,010	66,167	67,325	68,482	69,639	70,796	71,953
Masters	ש	59,453	60,453	61,593	62,733	63,873	65,030	66,187	67,344	68,501	69,658	70,815	71,972	73,129	74,286
M + 8 2023-202	<b>[</b> 5]	60,403	61,403	62,543	63,683	64,823	65,980	67,137	68,294	69,451	70,608	71,765	72,922	74,079	75,236
M + 16 24 STA Sal	[txt]	61,353	62,353	63,493	64,633	65,773	66,930	68,087	69,244	70,401	71,558	72,715	73,872	75,029	76,186
M + 8 M + 16 M + 24 N 2023-2024 STA Salary Schedule	r P	62,303	63,303	64,443	65,583	66,723	67,880	69,037	70,194	71,351	72,508	73,665	74,822	75,979	
M + 32	H	63,253	64,253	65,393	66,533	67,673	68,830	69,987	71,144	72,301	73,458	74,615	75,772	76,929	78,086
M + 40	<b> </b>	64,202	65,202	66,342	67,482	68,622	69,779	70,937	72,094	73,251	74,408	75,565	76,722	77,879	79,036
M + 48	اح	65,152	66,152	67,292	68,432	69,572	70,729	71,886	73,044	74,201	75,358	76,515	77,672	78,829	79,986
M + 56	×	66,102	67,102	68,242	69,382	70,522	71,679	72,836	73,993	75,151	76,308	77,465	78,622	79,779	80,936
M + 64	<del> </del>	67,052	68,052	69,192	70,332	71,472	72,629	73,786	74,943	76,100	77,258	78,415	79,572	80,729	81,886



7020 3160 0002 3059 1267

UNIFED STATES
POSTAL SERVICE



U.S. POSTAGE PAID FCM LETTER LANCASTER, PA 17604 MAR 31, 21 AMOUNT

\$6,50 R23038100051-03

APR 0 5 2021

Nathan Bortner

Pensylvanja Labor Relatius Board

651 Doas St, Rm 418

Harrisbug Ma 17121-0750

RETURNIRECEIPT

իլիլին լեկերեր իսկակայիլ անարկան անդակին ի