

Quarterly Board Meeting

Wednesday, November 6, 2019

10:00AM to 1:50PM

Pennsylvania School Boards Association

400 Bent Creek Boulevard, Mechanicsburg, Pennsylvania

Meeting Minutes

Attendance

Members: Jeffrey Brown, Chair; Secretary Gerard “Jerry” Oleksiak; Secretary Teresa Miller; Secretary Pedro Rivera; Idayat Adewunmi; Denise Andahazy; Tim Bean; Julene Campion; Wendie DiMatteo-Holsinger; Christopher Hackett; Timothy James; Marguerite Kline; Jodi Pace; Gregg Riefenstahl; Robert Scaer; Commissioner Michael Pipe; Senator Lindsey Williams; Rep. Morgan Cephas; Chekemma Fulmore-Townsend; Sarah Hollister; Peter Klein; Henry Nicholas; John “Ski” Sygielski; Matt Yarnell; Deputy Secretary Allison Jones, for Governor Tom Wolf; Executive Deputy Secretary Michael Hanna, Jr., for Secretary Russel Redding; Deputy Secretary Carol Kilko, for Secretary Dennis Davin; David Miles, for Secretary Robert Torres; Dorenda Hamarlund, for Secretary John Wetzel; Ralph Roach, for Executive Director Shannon Austin; Dillon Moore, for Jessica Trybus; Patrick Cawley, for Senator Camera Bartolotta; Jonas Ricci, for Representative Ryan Mackenzie; George Piasecki, for Bob McAuliffe

Presenters: Executive Deputy Secretary Michael Hanna Jr., PA Department of Agriculture; David Miles, PA Department of Aging; Deputy Secretary Carol Kilko, PA Department of Community and Economic Development; Dorenda Hamarlund, Department of Corrections; Secretary Pedro Rivera, PA Department of Education; Secretary Teresa Miller, PA Department of Human Services; Secretary Jerry Oleksiak, PA Department of Labor and Industry; Deputy Secretary Eileen Cipriani, PA Department of Labor and Industry; Ralph Roach; Office of Vocational Rehabilitation; Executive Director James Martini, PA Workforce Development Board; Chair John “Ski” Sygielski, Industry Partnership and Employer Engagement Committee; Chair Chekemma Fulmore-Townsend, Youth Committee; Chair Brown, Reentry Ad Hoc Committee; Chair Julene Campion, Career Pathways and Apprenticeship Committee; Denise Andahazy, Continuous Improvement Committee; Chair Matt Yarnell, Healthcare Ad Hoc Committee; Bradley Burger, Goodwill Southern Alleghenies; Jeff Dick; Site Administrator of Somerset and Cambria Counties; Gwen Fisher, Site Administrator of Bedford and Blair Counties; Director Susan Whisler, Southern Alleghenies Workforce Development Board; Abby Smith, Team Pennsylvania Foundation; Sarah Bauder, Pennsylvania State System of Higher Education

Staff: Executive Director James Martini, Mary Hoskins, Michelle Lengel

Welcome and Introductions

Chair Jeff Brown called the Quarterly Meeting to order at 10:05AM.

Chair's Updates

Chair Brown sought a motion to approve the minutes from August 13th, 2019.

MOTION: Mr. Nicholas moved to approve the August 13, 2019 minutes. Mr. Scaer seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Chair Brown then introduced the new board members, starting with Chekemma Fulmore-Townsend and asked her to say a few words as she became the Youth Committee chair.

Ms. Fulmore-Townsend commented that she was happy to join the Board and serve on the Youth Committee as she had been a member of the committee for quite some time. She remarked that she was looking forward to partnering with the other Board members to explore increasing opportunity across Pennsylvania for young people and to make sure that they have a career pathway.

Chair Brown then introduced Senator Lindsey Williams.

Senator Williams commented that she was glad to be there . She noted that as a the daughter of an operating engineer and working with the Pittsburgh Teachers Union, education and the job force is very important to her. Chair Brown asked if she was from the Pittsburgh area and Senator Williams responded that yes, she represents District 38 in Allegheny County.

Chair Brown then announced that they would also be joined by the new Executive Director for the Office of Vocational Rehabilitation, Shannon Austin, who was being represented by Ralph Roach.

Mr. Roach then commented that Ms. Austin was looking forward to joining the PA Workforce Development Board as an active partner and incorporating their talent and expertise in serving those with disabilities.

Chair Brown then noted that Brad Hollabaugh would not be in attendance at the meeting but that he is a fruit farmer and it would be good for the PA WDB to have a farmer to advise them on opportunities for that.

Agency Reports- Agriculture

Executive Deputy Secretary Michael Hanna, Jr. commented that the Department of Agriculture had been working with the Pennsylvania Department of Education and the Pennsylvania Commission for Agriculture Excellence on programs, certifications, licensures, and alignments. Executive Deputy Secretary Hanna also noted that the Department of Agriculture had a Farm City Day that was part of the Keystone International Livestock Exposition where they had about 2,500 young people show up to learn about agriculture. He noted that they were continuing to work on apprenticeships for agriculture equipment service technicians and the horticulture technician apprenticeship.

Agency Reports- Aging

Mr. David Miles noted that he did not have anything to add to the report in the briefing book beyond the fact that he went and visited all of their SCSEP field offices and stressed with the staff the importance of getting involved in the local Workforce Development Boards.

Agency Reports- Community and Economic Development

Department of Community and Economic Development Deputy Secretary Carol Kilko was not in attendance at the time of the report.

Agency Reports- Corrections

Ms. Dorenda Hamarlund commented that she did not have much to add beyond what was already in the briefing book. She noted that she wanted to highlight their Career Pathways Grant. She stated that they had a three-year grant through the Department of Education and that Kelly Martini helped develop and create it for Corrections. They extended it for one year and it ended on September 26th. They fully expended the full \$1 million for the grant. Ms. Hamarlund mentioned that Caitlin Nelson helped create a new curriculum for their inmates inside prisons. The program is called Pathways to Success and they had almost 6,200 inmates enrolled and almost 4,000 completed the program for a 64 percent completion rate over nine semesters.

Agency Reports- Education

PA Department of Education Secretary Pedro Rivera started by re-introducing Laura Fridirici. He noted that she had been working with the Department of Education on all things career readiness. Secretary Rivera noted that Ms. Fridirici would be his representative to the PA Workforce Development Board and would keep informing him of everything regarding the work. Secretary Rivera then noted that he wanted to highlight two areas in the PA Department of Education report. Secretary Rivera noted that their Career Ready PA Coalition has been working across the state and Laura Fridirici and her team were traveling across their ten regions and engaged with over 900 participants. He noted that about two-thirds of those were educators and one-third of the individuals were stakeholders. They also had local chambers and economic development partners engaged. Secretary Rivera commented that they learned through the meetings what their top priorities should be and it included communicating with stakeholders. He commented that they needed to saturate the geographic areas with the knowledge of how they are engaging workforce readiness and funding. Secretary Rivera then mentioned that Ms. Fridirici would be championing their projects around the region.

Agency Reports- Human Services

Secretary Teresa Miller highlighted that they were continuing to work on the TANF redesign and that they are really focused on the 2020 contracts and changes to get better long-term outcomes. She commented that they were looking at changing performance metrics so that they could get to a more individualized approach. Secretary Miller also noted that the Department of Human Services along with the Department of Education was getting ready to put out the procurement around parent pathways that would give communities an opportunity at pairing housing with post-secondary education to help single parents get education and get out of the cycle of poverty. She noted that they were going to award technical assistance and start-up funding for selected entities. Secretary Miller then commented that they were putting more money into some SNAP 50/50 programs in Philadelphia to expand training opportunities.

Chair Brown then asked if she would like to be on the next agenda to go over the changes that the Department would be making in the contracts. Secretary Miller asked when the next meeting was. Chair Brown responded that it would be in February and Secretary Miller responded that they should be able to comment on it.

Agency Reports- Labor and Industry

Secretary Oleksiak remarked that the Keystone Command Center had been busy, and that it its purpose was to be a cross organizational group that had been looking at what workforce is and that the PA Workforce Development Board had presented at one of the meetings. Secretary Oleksiak noted that the Keystone Command Center was also having regional meetings across the state to hear what the Pennsylvanians in those areas had to say. He remarked that he and Secretary Miller visited St. Luke's Hospital in Allentown which opened a satellite office of the PA CareerLink® and that it was the first of its kind.

He then continued by saying that the Apprenticeship Summit also occurred shortly before the November Board meeting and that there was about 600 participants, including people from other states and countries. Secretary Oleksiak then invited Deputy Secretary Eileen Cipriani to add any updates that she might have.

Deputy Secretary Cipriani noted that Workforce Development had just completed their second rebranding campaign. She commented that she was surprised but happy that they saw higher usage on their social media for individuals 55 and older so they will use that information to inform on their efforts next year. Deputy Secretary Cipriani also noted that the Department has a trade program and it is underutilized by people that are eligible for it. She noted that they are going to use the media campaign to increase knowledge around that. She commented that they could use things like geo-phasing to go after certain areas where there are big layoffs. Deputy Secretary Cipriani also noted that the Apprenticeship Summit was really successful and that Eric Ramsey did a phenomenal job and that it is a credit to him that there was a diverse crowd. She noted that there was going to be a vegetable grower program as the first of its kind, a robotics apprenticeship program, and a management trainee program which also solves problems within the Commonwealth of getting employees to the level of supervision management.

Deputy Secretary Cipriani mentioned that they also released the applications for the Business Education Partnerships and Teacher in the Workplace. Teacher in the Workplace is in partnership with the Department of Education and the grant totals \$5 million with \$2.5 million contributed from each agency involved. In its first year of inception, over 1,200 teachers participated. She mentioned that Laura Fridirici from the Department of Education and Department of Labor and Industry people worked very hard to put it together. She then noted that her last thing to mention was that there was an opiate grant and part of the grant was to engage businesses around the idea of taking a chance on individuals that are recovering from opiate use disorder. From that, they developed a partnership with the PA Department of Drug and Alcohol Programs and Penn State Dickinson to develop policy to help business figure out ways to adapt their practices to hire people.

Agency Reports- Office of Vocational Rehabilitation

Mr. Ralph Roach noted that they are requesting public comment on their portion of the combined state plan. He commented that it would be reviewed in December and then folded into the general WIOA Plan, 2020 to 2024. Mr. Roach then continued that Pennsylvania OVR staff was successful in helping approximately 7,500 individuals enter employment and start their careers and average wages were about \$13 an hour and maintaining the employment beyond the fifth quarter. Mr. Roach remarked that OVR was working with PDE and DHS to tap into their talent pipelines and introduce OVR staff to individuals that don't necessarily go to OVR. With PDE, that were still working to fully implement Act 26 which requires attendance at all IEP meetings, and Mr. Roach mentioned that they are having good success with that and the Act 26 outcome measures are posted on a quarterly basis. Under Act 36, they were working very closely with other state agencies and have always been committed to the idea of competitive, integrated employment. They were currently working with the Office of Administration to look at how Pennsylvania Civil Service and state employment is open to many individuals.

WIOA Combined State Plan Update

Chair Brown then asked James Martini to talk through the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act State Plan.

Mr. Martini first mentioned that the Teacher in the Workplace grants were live and the Summer Local Internship Program would hopefully be live by the end of the week.

Mr. Martini remarked that one of the primary functions of the PA State Workforce Board is to put together a combined state plan. There is the option to do either a unified plan, which only requires the core partners, or the combined plan which requires including additional partner programs in the process and outline how their programs integrate with the overall workforce system. Mr. Martini commented that the last program in PA was seen as the national leader in the integration of the number of programs it chose to include in the combined state plan. In addition to the core programs, which include Titles I, II, III, and IV. Title I has the adult program, the dislocated worker program and the youth program. He then noted that Title II contains the Adult Education and Literacy Act programs and Title III has Wagner-Peyser programs which allow for career readiness. Vocational Rehabilitation is also provided for in Title IV. In addition to that, Pennsylvania has elected to include the career technical education programs in the plan under the Perkins Act. They also include the Temporary Assistance for Needy Family programs under the Department of Human Services and Trade Adjustment Assistance program. There is also the Jobs for Veterans State Grant, the Senior Community Service Employment Program and the Community Services block grant which comes from the Department of Community and Economic Development and the reintegration of ex-offenders program from the Department of Corrections.

Mr. Martini noted that the work on the WIOA Combined State Plan began when Deputy Secretary Allison Jones was still Executive Director of the Workforce Development Board. Interagency workgroups started meeting in April 2019. There was also a working group for each of the Governor's five proposed goals for workforce development and each group met bi-weekly to ensure the incorporation of workforce into all the programs and agencies. Mr. Martini then continued that it was decided that the group wanted to gather input from stakeholders across the state so four listening sessions were set up in Philadelphia, Allentown, near State College, and in Canonsburg, Washington County. Mr. Martini then commented that because of an overwhelming response from people that wanted to participate in the process that an additional fifth session was added in Reading. He continued that the reports would be available for anyone that wanted to read them. Mr. Martini also flagged that they would be asked for

comments about the plan whether people liked the content or if there was other things that people wanted to see in the plan. Mr. Martini commented that the plan would go out for public comment around the middle of December.

Mr. Martini then said that the Vocational Rehabilitation Plan was going through at the same time and because they were a core partner, their plan would be going out at the same time but it couldn't go out until their board voted on it.

Mr. Martini also remarked that a lot of work had been in partnership with the Department of State surrounding occupational licensing reform and they had been great partners.

Mr. Martini then said that he wanted to get into the five goals set out from the governor and his team, and that a lot of them are interrelated. Mr. Martini commented that accompanying the goals was the infrastructure that the state has in place to measure the achievement and monitor progress. He then continued into explaining the five board goals. They elaborate into building out strong career pathways in the apprenticeship program and developing good sector strategies and engaging the employer community in an effective way. He mentioned that youth is a large priority within the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act so they wanted to make sure that it had its own specific focus within the plan. Another goal is specifically dedicated to the continuous improvement of the workforce development system in the commonwealth as the system should always be improving. Mr. Martini then commented that the fifth goal focuses on strengthening the one-stop delivery system, and for Pennsylvania it is the PA CareerLink®. He noted that the system is the touch point for everyone, whether it be employers or individuals and job seekers. The goal of enhancing service delivery is where all the partners would come together and work collaboratively to ensure that the best services are being provided.

Mr. Martini then commented that he wanted to bring up a few of the sub-goals under the five broad goals. He then mentioned that at the end of October, the Department had a huge conference around apprenticeship and pre-apprenticeship. He noted that it is a big goal of the governor and that it is a recognition that the apprenticeship model provides a great opportunity for people to earn while they learn and develop the skills that would move them into family sustaining, self-sustaining jobs. He commented that it is a model that the state wants to expand into other opportunities like reaching out to populations that haven't typically been afforded opportunities within the apprenticeship system. He then commented that they were looking to build on the Industry Partnership program through the PAsmart grant program as there was an additional \$4.8 million allocated to help build Pennsylvania's Industry Partnerships. There were also goals around more business engagement in a way that makes more sense in coordinating across agencies. One of the things that workforce development heard about throughout the years was employer fatigue where an employer got contacted by many state entities. From that, a goal is for the state to be more conscious of coordinating as to not overburden business. Mr. Martini then noted the biggest goal surrounding youth was opportunity youth. He commented that in the past they would have been called disadvantaged youth or unschooled youth and that the younger they are, it is easier to reintegrated them into the workforce system and back on a strong career pathway. Within continuous improvement, he wanted to flag the concept of joint guidance. He remarked that it is something the state often asks of the federal government so they wanted to put out guidance to programs or partners on how they should operate and they want it to come in a coordinated manner from the state so that local partners have an understanding of what expectations

are being asked of them. Finally, within the one-stop service delivery system the goal is coordination and collaboration. The goal is for all of the partners to work together and that if an individual went to a one stop and needed services from multiple places, that they would be taken care of in a thoughtful and intentional way.

Mr. Martini then stated that part of the WIOA Combined State Plan was to move the PA Workforce Development Board from four committees to five committees and that the new one would focus around one-stop service delivery. He noted that it would be an opportunity for Board members to give feedback within the process and a more intentional inclusion of all the different partner agencies that participate in the one-stop system.

Chair Brown then announced that the only person that signed up for public comment was Dan Fogarty.

Mr. Fogarty noted that he was looking forward to working with the state on the new plan. He noted that on the fourth page, section two in emerging demand industry sectors and occupations and that his comments would be pertinent to the second paragraph specifically regarding the manufacturing sector in Pennsylvania. Mr. Fogarty then asked if any board members represented PA manufacturing and three did. He stated that he thought that the Board was accurate in the statement about how manufacturing is projected to decline more than the past projections but significantly less than the US. He thought it was a true statement but that it missed the point. Mr. Fogarty then used the analogy of a iceberg to expand on his thought that the output of the sector will grow dramatically, but manufacturing will just need fewer and more highly skilled people than what is needed right now. He noted that probably half of the workforce in manufacturing in Pennsylvania is already over the age of 45 and a quarter of them are over 55. He estimated that they are going to need 150,000 to 200,000 workers statewide with 10,000 alone needed in Berks County and states that there is no pipeline to support it. He then remarked that many manufacturers are already turning jobs down because they don't have the people they need. From that Mr. Fogarty urged the Board to look underneath the water of the iceberg because that was probably the largest single threat to the future prosperity for the Commonwealth to him. He continued that if Pennsylvania could not attract the workers then they would be attractive to recruit away to other states.

Chair Brown said that the Board appreciated the feedback and that it seemed common sense but also asked the manufacturing representatives on the Board if there was more to be added.

Ms. Jodi Pace remarked that their average age for manufacturing was 50 and that they struggle to find qualified employees.

Ms. Wendie DiMatteo-Holsinger stated that she concurred and thought that workforce will be the issue and that they are automating but it will never take all of the numbers from manufacturing.

Ms. Pace then stated that they have not been struggling to fill positions in other states and for every automation they use, they need a higher skilled employee to operate and repair it. Because of that, they have chosen not to automate because it is harder to find some of those positions.

Chair Brown then mentioned that as a retailer, the logistics industry is having the same problem of an aging workforce with not a clear vision towards their replacement when they retire and asked if Mr. Martini could take that into consideration. Mr. Martini stated absolutely.

Southern Alleghenies Presentation

Chair Brown then introduced the presenters from Southern Alleghenies who were Bradley Burger (president/CEO of Goodwill Southern Alleghenies), Jeff Dick (site administrator of Somerset and Cambria Counties), Gwen Fisher (site administrator of Bedford and Blair counties), and Susan Whisler (Director of the Southern Alleghenies Workforce Development Board).

Ms. Whisler remarked that she was excited to share some of the things happening in the Southern Alleghenies division. Ms. Whisler then went on to comment that the Southern Alleghenies region encompasses over 340,000 square miles of territory in PA and much of it is very rural. She noted that only three counties, Bedford, Blair, and Cambria, had public transportation and many of the 450,000 residents have no access to internet at home. Given those barriers, the Southern Alleghenies Workforce Development Board has placed significant emphasis and resources on supporting physical one-stops so that there would be a physical place for residents to receive services.

Ms. Whisler noted that they were currently supporting five comprehensive sites, four affiliate sites, and scores of other locations located throughout their six counties in libraries, in senior, and public housing areas where staff travels to provide services. She also noted that they are seeing an increasing demand for services so they think strategically about where to locate one-stops.

Mr. Burger then joined in and noted that Goodwill of Southern Alleghenies took on the role as lead operator with a consortium of operators in July of 2017. The Board staff had asked how to support them and the Goodwill of Southern Alleghenies asked for the permission to break things and to fail and because of the license that they were afforded because of that, they got to innovation. From the innovation they formed a consortium of operators and decided to go through the cycles of understanding where their customers were and how they could best serve them. The two rules that the operators group has is to leave egos at the door and focus on the customer.

Mr. Burger commented that they put together a short survey customized to each county and put together a gift certificate for a drawing. The survey ran for about a month and they got good participation. Mr. Burger then referenced their presentation and noted that from the survey 67 percent of people in Cambria County said that if they wanted services they would go to a PA CareerLink® but 14 percent said that they would go to a library and there was similar results for Blair County. Mr. Burger then noted that they discovered from the process how much people were utilizing digital gateways into job search so they also sought to innovate how they deal with the digital aspect.

Mr. Dick then noted that he is the site administrator for framework in Cambria and Somerset Counties and then noted that in the city of Johnstown, they are well known for the three floods with the last one being in 1977 which basically shut down their steel industry. He noted that they had just under 21,000 people at the last census and with the next census they are expecting it to be even lower at around 18,000. He noted that most of their customers have been lower-skilled, harder to serve populations and that is partly what triggered their innovative work. They had realized that about 48 percent of their customers were within a three-mile radius of the City of Johnstown and when they started looking at the city they looked at the public library and the library had an average of 160,000 people going through it a year. They had three floors and a total of 43,000 square feet. They also had observed that during the holiday seasons and into January, a lot of people were coming into use the UC phone. From seeing people wait, they came up with the idea of using restaurant style pagers and were sending people into

the library to flip through a magazine or a book while they waited. Mr. Dick also noted that from the savings of moving into the library they were able to expand into two more areas and were still saving \$20,000 a year. He also noted that they had an 18 percent increase average in traffic.

Mr. Dick then commented that they had a back-to-school community resource fair and they had close to 150 participants with children going to the library and the PA CareerLink®. They also have their local state senator offering their resources there one day a month to the customers.

Ms. Fisher then noted that the Blair County PA CareerLink® is located in the middle of Altoona, Pennsylvania and mentioned some of their biggest companies. She then remarked that their prior site was not on a public transportation route and that they had more square footage than they needed. They went down to about 60 percent of the previous square footage and were able to open up an affiliate site about seven miles south of the city center with the money saved. Ms. Fisher noted that they were not without their challenges. They eventually relocated to the public library on their mezzanine hall. They did note that the reduced square footage did give them a few challenges. Ms. Fisher then mentioned that they were meeting with library staff and they were cross pollinating their websites and were sharing social media activities. She noted that one of their biggest successes was that the Altoona Area High School brought in about 500 students between 8th and 12th grade for tours of the library and the PA CareerLink® got a chance to talk to them about the learn and earn program. She then remarked that the move has generated a lot of publicity for them and they recently hosted the largest job fair that their community had seen in a while and Senator Judy Ward and Deputy Secretary Eileen Cipriani were there. The Altoona School District also sent seniors to the job fair by bus to explore careers or employers.

Ms. DiMatteo-Holsinger asked how many people they had attend. Ms. Fisher noted that it was almost 100 people and 100 employers which was significant for their area.

Ms. Whisler then chimed back in and remarked that they had never envisioned gaining national recognition but it turns out that they were the first and second comprehensive one-stop to be located in public libraries. She remarked that they have been keeping the customer in the center and involving the staff at all levels from day one.

Chair Brown then asked if anyone had questions.

Ms. DiMatteo-Holsinger then asked if they had an opinion on how to duplicate the process that they had across the state with the lessons learned.

One of the presenters commented that agility over stability is important as they want to make sure that they are in the right spot to serve people. They also noted that innovation is the key factor.

Ms. Whisler then remarked that the Southern Alleghenies Board listened to staff and thought outside the box.

Ms. Holsinger then asked about how to take it to other locations.

Chair Brown commented that the Southern Alleghenies example should be shared with other local workforce boards. He then thanked them for the presentation and said that they did an impressive job.

Committee Updates- Industry Partnerships and Employer Engagement

Dr. John “Ski” Sygielski noted that there was a few things that he wanted to note on from the summary in the briefing book. One of them was about how the committee had talked about ways that they could engage partners and ways to engage individuals who are in frontline positions and how to incorporate that into the committee’s work. There was a survey done but they are exploring many different ways to bring people together and share best practices. Dr. Sygielski also mentioned that they really wanted to work with IOA goal 2.1 and promote partnerships throughout the state.

Committee Updates- Youth

Ms. Chekemma Fulmore-Townsend noted that the committee left off in August at looking at a common definition and that the committee planned to pick up in the middle of November and look at the capacity of programs across the Commonwealth and how it fit into the definition. She noted that with the opportunity to contribute to the plan, they were going to be thoughtful and intentional about how different groups’ needs vary.

Chair Brown thanked Ms. Fulmore-Townsend and noted about the budget cycle for recommendations.

Committee Updates- Reentry Ad Hoc

Chair Brown noted that there was a roundtable listening session on October 22nd at Triple Bottom Brewery. Chair Brown then asked Ms. Denise Andahazy her impression about the event and what was learned.

Ms. Andahazy noted that she participated as an employer and it was a very robust discussion around the benefits of hiring reentrants and what the barriers to hiring reentrants were. She also noted that it was great to network with the associations and other employers to understand what the local partners were doing. She remarked that she also participated in the debrief after the event so there was a lot of great conversation about how to improve the session and grow it across the state to engage with local employers on the topic.

Ms. DiMatteo-Holsinger asked what Ms. Andahazy thought could be improved in the session for other areas. Ms. Andahazy responded that there was discussion around maybe limiting some of the speakers or simply shortening the session so that more employers might invest the time. They had also talked about in future sessions to leverage the Next Generation Industry partnerships, the local chambers and to overall get more local employer involvement. Representative Morgan Cephas then added a thank you for having the conversation. She remarked that elected officials always look at the tax credits and she learned early on that tax credits aren’t always incentives for businesses because of the amount of paperwork. She was wondering if there were any other policy recommendations that would help businesses to improve their work with ex-offenders?

Chair Brown stated that he would address Representative Cephas’ questions. He noted that they wanted to hold the roundtables to get statewide feedback from the employers. He noted that the paperwork had been an issue and that more thought has to go into how the state handles the process. He noted that the plan is to go around the state and come up with a comprehensive list of things the committee can look at. Chair Brown also remarked that he would like to take all of the feedback and come up with some policy recommendations to consider.

Committee Updates- Career Pathways and Apprenticeship

Ms. Julene Campion remarked that beyond the report in the briefing book, that she wanted to expand on the research that the committee had partnered with a vendor on. Ms. Campion then noted that she would like to work with the Youth Committee about their work as they evaluate the definition that the Career Pathways Committee came up with. She noted that about 13 interviews had been conducted and that more people were welcome to participate as they would like to have participation from other PA WDB committees. Some highlights of the conversations thus far had been realizing how different everyone's understand of career pathways was. With the 13 people that had been interviewed so far, there had been about 3 common themes working together. The broader interpretation of Career Pathways was making career awareness for K through 12 and that is the broad description that people had been giving. A narrower definition was thought of as job sequencing for adults and an even narrower focus was for adults with barriers to employment. She also noted that there had been broad support for strengthening the connection between education, training and business. Another highlight was that there is recognition that a lot of positive work going on in Pennsylvania but that it was not being shared broadly enough to connect with the bigger picture for Pennsylvania. The fourth highlight from Ms. Campion is that the committee needs the strong support for businesses and for deeper engagement. Ms. Campion then stated that as the committee starts to collate the research and connect it back to goal one from the plan, the next approach would be to start creating the calendar year 2020 milestones and decide where to go next.

Committee Updates- Continuous Improvement

Chair Brown noted that since committee chair Brain Funkhouser was available to be in attendance that Ms. Denise Andahazy would present. Ms. Andahazy noted that under the continuous improvement goal, that there was a sub-goal tied to publishing data on the state workforce development system. The sub-goal is meant to help with transparency and credibility in the workforce development system. They decided that the best approach would be to use metrics that were already available versus attempting to engage new ones. She noted that the briefing book had the recommendations that were approved by the Continuous Improvement Committee for recommendations to the whole Board. Ms. Andahazy remarked that the recommendation included supportive data that was already reported to the government on state and local workforce development areas; information on discretionary grants awarded by Pennsylvania, and any other state development performance data. She also noted that the metrics were a great starting point that they can build off in the future. She stated that once the Board approved it, Mr. Martini would take it top the Governor and once it was approved there, work would begin on publishing the dashboard and was hopeful that the dashboard would be up in running in 2020.

Chair Brown then asked Ms. Andahazy to reiterate the recommendation and she remarked that the board was voting on a recommendation for metrics to include on the dashboard. Chair Brown asked if the metrics had been determined. Ms. Andahazy remarked that they were in the briefing book and Chair Brown asked for a motion. Dr. Sygielski moved to approved with Mr. Nicholas echoing his support. Representative Morgan Cephas asked if it would include tracking the number of individuals in a Career Pathway and if it would be embedded in the employment rate or would it appear as a state performance indicator. Mr. Martini responded that one of the options in the guidance that was received from the federal government on states that develop their own performance metrics that Pennsylvania identifies as important. He remarked that the recommendation was the initial thing that would be going on the dashboard but that the dashboard could continue to expand as new metrics would be identified. Representative Cephas commented that she took Mr. Martini's remarks to mean that the metrics will be

continually developed and she noted that if that is the case, she supports it whole heartedly. Mr. Martini then commented that they were very intentional about the goals created so that they can track progress.

Representative Cephas then asked if the committee engaged the local Workforce Board on the recommendation. Ms. Andahazy remarked that the committee didn't specifically. Mr. Martini chimed in that the committee did not but all of the metrics in the recommendation were currently being collected and reported to the state and then the federal government. Representative Cephas then asked if it was being made public. Mr. Martini responded that that is where the gap is. Representative Cephas asked if there was a reason the committee didn't engage them. Mr. Martini said that the information was already being collected and was just a matter of making it public. Representative Cephas then commented that when information is made public, people can pick at it without actually having a conversation with the entity. Mr. Martini said that that was a fair point. Representative Cephas then asked if a benchmark goal was going to be reported as well. Mr. Martini responded that that is where the actual performance and negotiated levels factor in. The local boards negotiate with the state government to come up with targeted measures. The negotiated level is the target and the actual performance is how it aligns to the negotiated level. Representative Cephas asked if the target would be reported. Mr. Martini responded that both of those would be reported under how the recommendation was written up. Representative Cephas asked that if they were going to be reporting on the discretionary grant awards, if they would then also be reporting on their metrics as well as recipients. Mr. Martini responded that that is the goal as any time the state is giving out discretionary money, they want to be able to show what the money did. Representative Cephas asked if there was a plan for engaging current recipients and past recipients to learn if that is something they do or don't want to do. Mr. Martini responded that it is one of the things that they are doing and one of the things that they want to do. He remarked that it might involve more intentionally moving forward with awards to be more thoughtful about what the state is trying to accomplish with that money. Representative Cephas asked if there had been any conversations with the local Workforce Boards or if it was going to be a surprise. Mr. Martini commented that several of them were in attendance at the Board meeting and that if the chair was interested in hearing from them, it would be of value. Chair Brown remarked that he would like to hear from the local partners and that the Board only has the power to recommend to the Governor.

Ms. Erica Mulberger, the Executive Director of the Central Workforce Development Board, said that she would speak. She remarked that she had just assumed it was already public and they operated under that assumption so they were not concerned about that. She then stated that with the information of the discretionary grant recipient award announced, that it went out in a public press release. She stated that the only thing that she would have potential concerns about would be the grant outcome if they weren't meeting expectations as to add a note of serious lagging in the metrics. She stated that everything they report to the state, they consider it public.

Chair Brown thanked her for speaking and asked if there was any other comments. Ms. Andahazy asked to make a further comment and noted that they had talked about including many more metrics but they decided to start with the metrics that the state already has and in the future they can add new metrics where there is an opportunity to do so. Ms. DiMatteo- Holsinger asked if there were comparisons done because of the variability across the state. She stated that she was curious as to what was being looked at currently and in the future. Mr. Martini remarked that there was a great amount of variability across

local areas simply because of economic conditions varied and the individuals varied. Mr. Martini then stated that his understanding of the metrics is that the local Workforce Board metrics are sewn together to get the state committee performance. The state then works with the local areas to make sure that the levels are studied in a way that makes sense due to the economic conditions and the individuals that they are attempting to serve. Ms. DiMatteo-Holsinger then state that Mr. Martini did not answer her question. She then asked how they are sharing targets in a way that is encouraging yet challenging. Mr. Martini responded that they are doing this because they want to be able to understand how the numbers are interpreted. He noted that the statewide workforce recently went through an audit and he thinks that there was potential for the data to be interpreted better. He noted that in his own personal opinion is looking at how different areas have differences. He stated that the actual performance relative to that benchmark is a lot more important for the state than to just see a plain comparison if one is higher than another. Chair Brown then summarized the remarks and said that it was recommended to add a comments section.

MOTION: Chair Brown asked Dr. Sygielski and Mr. Nicholas if they were okay with the modification and they responded in the affirmative. The motion passed unanimously.

Chair Brown then asked Mr. Martini that for subsequent meetings, if he could give an update on approved recommendations and Mr. Martini said he would.

Ms. Andahazy commented that they haven't even started on the design of the dashboard and she believes that James will keep the Board updated. Chair Brown commented that if it gets approved that the committee should share their ideas with the whole PA WDB.

Ms. Campion then asked if they would choose to add more performance data that the Board would review and approve it before it went on the dashboard. Mr. Martini responded that that is the intention and that if anyone is welcome to help design the dashboard and/ or join the committee.

Chair Brown noted that he would like to sit down with local Workforce Boards for their feedback.

Committee Report- Healthcare Ad Hoc

Mr. Matt Yarnell commented that they expanded the scope of the committee. He noted that as a committee they were trying to collect data and create a recommendation that declares that there is a crisis. He noted that the jobs they are looking at are poverty jobs and have a huge turnover in a workforce that is a workforce of women, mostly women of color. He noted that Pennsylvania's care giving economy is facing significant challenges including the fact that there is a growing crisis among the Commonwealth's workforce of professional caregivers. He noted that wages for those workers are really low and that employers provided benefits are not often offered. Part of what they are looking at is what it actually costs to live in Pennsylvania and what can provide a living wage. Another challenge that they are looking at is that the work is often considered entry level. He noted that their next planned step was take a deeper dive on the data. Mr. Martini noted they tried to capture similarities in jobs for the list in wages, work activities, and the manner of the jobs.

Dr. Sygielski commented when working with healthcare systems in central Pennsylvania, the number one job that they are seeking is medical assistants and HACC will be working on an apprenticeship for medical assistants. They are also doing a lot of online training for healthcare staff. Ms. DiMatteo-Holsinger commented that from personal experience that they are paying a good wage and that she is

curious about how the low unemployment rate has affected it. She also commented that she serves on a retirement board and the aide wages there have gone up. She commented that she believed that healthcare facilities were finding that they were not keeping people unless they were competitive with the wages. Mr. Yarnell commented that they wanted to pull apart the data to be able to give the Board a closer look. He continued that for homecare there was about eight people living in a community who need services to every one caregiver and that it is a quickly growing sector in Pennsylvania. Mr. Nicholas commented that he would love to be on the committee and Mr. Yarnell welcomed him. Representative Cephas commented that there is a national conversation happening around maternal mortality and mothers are passing away due to complications with their pregnancy. One of the possible solutions would be to certify and reimburse doula care as well as bolstering midwifery. She noted that there was investment from the federal government and that Pennsylvania received \$2.5 million to address maternal mortality and that Temple University is also working on a pilot career pathway. Chair Brown then brought up the Domestic Workers' Bill of Rights from Philadelphia and noted that it might be trying to address some of the issues. Mr. Yarnell then noted that he also serves on the Better Health and Care Council where they published a blueprint on how to deal with the direct care worker workforce and thinks that the Healthcare Ad Hoc committee is trying to build a crisis statement that is a bit broader, and not just long term care. Mr. Yarnell also commented that he would like the committee to explore some solutions and recommendations. He also mentioned that the work is also largely funded so thinking about how he believes that government money should not be subsidizing low wage jobs versus a living wage. Secretary Jerry Oleksiak then mentioned that MIT has a living wage calculator on the Internet and it can be broken down by state, regional, and county levels. Ms. Allison Jones then added that the Office of Childhood Development and Early Learning which is from both Department of Human Services and the Department of Education has a lot of data around the early childcare workforce so they would be able to contribute data for the committee.

Mr. Yarnell then added they put a one page summary in the briefing book but they actually had a six page document in the works. Ms. Julene Campion then noted that she is from Geisinger and she wanted to echo Dr. Sygielski's comment about medical assistants. She noted that they are expanding their practices over the next five years and do not have nearly enough medical assistants or certified medical assistants. She also said there is also an emerging role for Community Health Assistant or CHA which are embedded in the community. It is not a credentialed job but it is an important aspect of preventative care. She also commented that jobs were identified by an increasing demand for them related to Pennsylvania's growing senior citizen population. She then noted that RN and LPN role was not on the list. She speculated that it is because it makes a living wage but noted that there is a nursing shortage so she was curious as to why RNs and CNAs were not part of the scope. Mr. Yarnell commented that they didn't include licensed caregivers because they largely have programs to support their advancement and they wanted to give the lowest wage people a pathway to a living wage.

Chair Brown then announced that they would be taking a lunch break.

Agency Report- Community and Economic Development

Chair Brown then welcomed everyone back from lunch and asked Deputy Secretary Carol Kilko to give her report for the Department of Community and Economic Development. She noted that the Keystone Economic Development and Workforce Command Center was trying to break down silence between the agencies and provided the example of the Department of Corrections, with the help of the PA Chamber

of Business and Industry had numerous private businesses contact the Commonwealth related to reentry webinars on hiring reentrants and Gene Barr, the President and CEO of the Pennsylvania Chamber of Business and Industry, visited a prison. She also noted that the PA Chamber and the Department of Human Services were exploring the business sector for expansion of childcare. The Keystone Command Center also has five working committees on barriers to employment, best practices, government and structure, data jobs, and skills for the future. She noted that committee recommendations would be presented to the Governor in a report. She remarked that DCED also supports a lot of activity at the Department of Labor and Industry as far as workforce development is concerned and that the DCED pre-apprentice and apprenticeship grant program had been really active.

Pennsylvania's Educate4Opportunity

Chair Brown then asked Abby Smith, Director of Education and Workforce Development for Team Pennsylvania Foundation, and Sarah Bauder, Chief Transformation Officer for the Pennsylvania State System of Higher Education to give their presentation on Pennsylvania Educate4Opportunity. Ms. Smith thanked the PA WDB for the opportunity to speak about the grant opportunities. She noted that one of the major overarching goals was to have the work elevate the specific calculation that they were going to talk about in their presentation. She noted that the Team Pennsylvania Foundation is a statewide organization that is a separate Title 501(c) (3) nonprofit in which the Governor serves as the co-chair of the board as well as agency secretaries and members of the legislature representing all four caucuses. The majority of the Board is made of Pennsylvania-based chief executive officers from all across the state, different industries, different geographies, and different kinds of business. Ms. Bauder then introduced herself and remarked that for those not familiar with PASSHE, they are 14 comprehensive universities that have the depth and reach across the Commonwealth and that many of their institutions are the economic engine in the rural counties that they serve. They also educate a little under 100,000 students every year, usually of low to moderate income. In July of 2019, NGA put out a call for proposals and PA submitted their idea to look at the some college, no degree population and was selected. The grant that the state received was for a \$100,000 planning grant for two years and they are looking at some college, no degree students to figure out how to up-skill and re-skill the adult learner. She noted that it takes a lot of people to create an entire pipeline and then they have to think about reverse transfer and reengage with the students and talk to them about credentials.

Ms. Bauder noted that from a statewide view of Pennsylvania, PA has the third highest number of institutions of higher education in the nation but only 46 percent of PA residents have a credentials. It is estimated that in the future, sixty-three percent of jobs in the state are going to require some type of credential and the state was trying to understand what the job market looks like. She noted that PA is very good at educating the traditional 18 year going to college but that that demographic is quickly declining in an expected 20 to 25 percent drop. That decline requires the state to look at adjacent markets. That includes non-traditional students that need to be up-skilled and re-skilled. She also stated that the data shows that there is currently five generations of employees and because of the varied differences, it changes the landscape and narrative on how to address industry and education.

Ms. Smith then remarked that they know that they are not going to be able to achieve everything with the grant they received but that their overarching goal is to reduce the number of near and partial completers and to connect those people with relevant postsecondary educational opportunities in an effort to work to close the existing workforce gap. She also noted that there are 1.4 million adults in PA

with some postsecondary education with no degree or credentials and that is a significant chunk of a six-plus million worker system. She noted that part of the process is trying to understand who the population is and that while the state collects a lot of data, sometimes it is never analyzed on a policy level. She stated that as part of the grant as well that would be to use data from other national partners, including the Strada Education group, and once that picture is complete, they are going to work as a team and develop state level policy around the population. Ms. Smith noted that with the increase needed in people with credentials, that that increase will not just come from high schoolers and training that age group, it will have to come from the near completers as well. She then continued by noting that they wanted to hear from the PA Workforce Development Board members and how this issue fit into their work and companies.

Senator Lindsey Williams remarked that she would be interested in the data that they would be looking and asked if they would be looking into barriers for the population as well. Ms. Smith noted that yes they would look into it but they would not be doing comprehensive focus groups and would be relying on data from other national partners for help in that regard. Ms. Bauder then remarked that from the PASSHE side, they had started looking at the quantitative and they saw the 13 percent of people that left had 90 credits or more and from that they are looking inward at their policies. Ms. Kline noted that her mother was going for her Associate's when she was born and her mother dropped out and when she went back through a federal program she had difficulties because she didn't know what a USB port was. Ms. Bauder noted that Gen Z is the first digital native population so every other generation has to be skilled and re-skilled. Ms. DiMatteo-Holsinger noted that private liberal arts schools are also looking at their retention. Ms. Pace asked if they would be looking at industries people did not complete their degrees in. Ms. Bauder answered that the largest number of students who drop out are undeclared and it is being called the focus factor and institutions are looking at how to help those students recognize a natural skill and get into a major. Ms. Smith noted that they want to get the whole picture of the population and that they will also look at closing workforce gaps. Part of the work will also be acknowledging the work that the past students put in and making sure that they will be in a field where they can have maximal earning potential.

Ms. Pace asked if they were not including students who went to trade school and were receiving on the job training. Ms. Smith remarked that if they had a credential, they were not being included in the numbers. Ms. Pace remarked that she wasn't even talking about credentials, she remarked that she was aware of programs where students could go through phase one and get a great job that doesn't make them do the second part and get a degree or credential. Ms. Smith responded that that based on that, then they would be included in the numbers. She noted that when it actually comes to targeting resources that that wouldn't be a place where they would want to focus. She noted that they would have to figure out all of the different subsets of the population and if an individual would be able to identify good earning opportunities. Mr. Yarnell commented that he knows of a training fund that could provide data about what it is like to be an adult learner. Ms. Smith commented that they would take that information. Secretary Oleksiak asked if there was a plan for data sharing between different state entities because he noted that it is often very difficult. Ms. Smith remarked that they assembled their group based on who was willing to be a collaborator and explore the issue. She also noted that PA is a unique state and does not allow for collected post-secondary data for the majority of institutions, but especially four year institutions. She noted that the Center for Workforce Information and Analysis within the PA Department of Labor and Industry was a valuable partner in the endeavor. She also noted

that the State System for Higher Education could also share the data without restrictions but that there is no such connection with community colleges. Ms. Smith also noted that it would not be possible without all of the leadership from the Governor's office and the different secretaries involved.

Ms. Smith then asked Board members how they see themselves fitting into the work and what it means to them if someone does or does not complete a degree or credential. Chair Brown remarked that he has found that when they promote someone to management, it is useful for them to have completed their degree especially if it is a technical field. Ms. DiMatteo-Holsinger then commented that they struggle in their quality assurance area for that. She remarked that they prefer if they have a degree but they do hire people and have them continue their education while learning on the job. Ms. Bauder remarked that the research has shown that the signaling device for employers has been the degree traditionally but the longitudinal data shows the trend changing and that they are starting to look at credentialing and awards as being the signaling device for the knowledge that one has. Ms. Pace then remarked that her employer more so looks at credentialing and skills and that her senior management team only has two people with degrees. She remarked that they predominantly promote from within and that credentialing is more important for them. Ms. Bauder then asked Ms. Pace what her industry was. Ms. Pace responded that she works for a food manufacturer and that they are very specific and technical in the style that they do so that is why the technical training is important for them. Mr. Riefenstahl then remarked that he works for Penske Transportation and that they are willing to train people with the acumen for the job. He remarked that everyday they realize and feel the lack of technical skilled individuals for jobs. Mr. Riefenstahl also asked if any research had been done around people's willingness to go back and finish up degrees. Ms. Bauder responded that there has been some research around it and that they are exploring options to fit around the adult lifestyle like online classes. Ms. Smith also commented that there is also technical assistance from the national partners that can help with relevancy. She notes that there has been research that the more relevant your post-secondary educational experience, the more likely you are to continue with it or return to it. Ms. Sarah Hollister commented that reengaging the possible students was critical and that tuition reimbursement policies of employers would also been critical. She also commented that she would like to see a state policy strategy that includes any leverage like employer tax credits or on-the-job training. Mr. Yarnell commented that for their training funds, they have been trying to work with community colleges and upfront pay for training for the workers and it takes a barrier off of the worker.

Ms. Smith then commented a few people had mentioned barriers and that they are hoping to highlight what some of the regional differences are in a deep data dive. Mr. Timothy James then commented that if a solid career pathway is identified earlier on for students then they will be more motivated in post high school programs and be going for a degree that they want to go for. Ms. DiMatteo-Holsinger commented that she wanted to clarify her remarks that they still have jobs that do require degrees. Ms. Smith commented that they are working under the premise that 65 percent of jobs in 2025 will require some sort of credential or degree. Deputy Secretary Allison Jones thanked them for presenting and noted that the Strada data can help get a consumer insight about how people think about credentials. Ms. Jones also noted that they could possibly go back to Strada and ask if they could also help them understand the employer perspective.

Chair Brown then asked Ms. Smith and Ms. Bauder if they got what they were looking for. Ms. Smith replied that they did but she still had a question. She then asked what actions the presentation and conversation had triggered for work on the Board and its committees. Ms. Champion remarked that it

made her think about the 30,000 employees and if they fall into that category, how can they help support them to continue their education. She stated that they would think about how they identify that population and separately thinking about how their tuition reimbursement policy only covers degrees. Ms. Fulmore-Townsend then noted one piece that would be useful to consider was how the credential or degree they are going for in terms of their expectations around leadership. She also noted that she is on the Community College of Philadelphia's Board and one of the things they noted was that their structure wasn't set up for momentum. She remarked that they have a developmental education problem that is keeping people from acquiring credentials. Chair Brown said that he wondered if people that dropped out because they are alternative learners and traditional education does not work for them. Ms. Bauder noted that if you look at data, YouTube is the number two educator in the world. She noted that gaining intellectual property has changed and so it has to be incorporated in terms of thinking about assessment.

Chair Brown then thanked them for the presentation and said that the PA WDB was looking forward to keeping up with their progress.

Chair Brown then noted that no one had signed up for public comment. He then asked for a motion to adjourn.

MOTION: Mr. Nicholas made the motion to adjourn and Ms. Fulmore-Townsend seconded it. The motion passed unanimously.

The meeting concluded at 1:50pm.